



# PRIVATIZING K-12 PUBLIC EDUCATION

## HOW THE PROFIT MOTIVE CHANGES SCHOOLS

Dr. Lawrence Baines, *The University of Oklahoma*, [lbaines@ou.edu](mailto:lbaines@ou.edu)

Dr. Jennie L. Hanna, *Cameron University*, [jhanna@cameron.edu](mailto:jhanna@cameron.edu)

**What are privatized schools?** Privatized schools are schools that are funded by the public, but are run like private businesses. Privatized schools include charters, vouchers, Education Savings Accounts, and Tax Credit Scholarships.

**Many privatized schools are not held accountable.** Privatized schools are under no obligation to make records public or to abide by federal guidelines for special education, equal rights, and due process. While public schools are held accountable for every penny, most tax-supported privatized schools can do what they want with regard to curriculum, spending, and policy.<sup>1</sup>

**Privatized schools tend to segregate children.** The evidence that privatized schools act as agents of segregation is well documented. From selective admissions to a narrowed curriculum, privatized schools tend to be monocultural and radically different from the traditional, integrated public school.<sup>2</sup>

**Privatized schools tend to denigrate teacher quality.** Charter and private schools are not required to hire certified teachers. In some states, a teacher at a privatized school need not even hold a bachelor's degree. Teachers in privatized schools are often paid significantly lower salaries and about half of charter schools offer no health insurance or retirement plans.<sup>3</sup> There are no alternative certification programs and no emergency certification programs in Finland or Singapore, whose students are among the highest-performing in the world. Finland and Singapore incentivize teaching and require all teachers have master's degrees from accredited universities.<sup>4</sup>

### **The bottom line – privatized schools:**

- Do not improve performance.
- Concentrate tax dollars in the salaries of a few administrators.
- Lead to segregated schools.
- Are not transparent (though funded by tax dollars).
- Lack oversight and are not held accountable.
- Divert money from students who go to public schools.

## CHARTER SCHOOLS

One of the most famous charter schools is Harlem Children's Zone in New York. Harlem Children's Zone currently pays its principal almost a million dollars a year and pays other administrators double what comparable public school administrators get. The same is true of the owner/operators of KIPP, who make hundreds of thousands of dollars a year. In addition to high salaries for owner/operators, charters often pay high salaries to non-instructional personnel, such as "chief external impact officers," "publicity coordinators" and "directors of development."<sup>5</sup>

## SELECTIVE ADMISSIONS

It is not well known that Geoffrey Canada, founder of the Harlem Children's Zone charter school, fired his entire first class of students because of their low-test scores. With both Harlem Children's Zone and KIPP schools, parents must sign an agreement that they will always get their child to school on time, will always attend school events, will ensure their children do their homework, and will bring their children to school on Saturdays or Sundays as requested.

## Privatizing K-12 Public Education

Parents who do not have transportation or cannot abide by these rules cannot enroll their children in these schools. Privatized schools can expel any student at will.<sup>6</sup> A report from UCLA found that charter schools expelled, on average, 25% of their African American students. On the other hand, public schools are expected to serve all children, regardless of income, disability, or special needs.<sup>7</sup>

## CHARTERS AND TEST SCORES

Many public school students do as well or better than students from charter or private schools on a variety of measures—high school graduation rates, test scores, college enrollment rates, feelings of safety at school, and satisfaction with school. Public schools will never do well against “no-excuses” charter schools because such schools select out or expel the lowest-performing and most troublesome students.<sup>8</sup>

**Charters in Michigan** – Most charter schools in Michigan (80%) are run for profit. Because charter schools tend to hire inexperienced, uncertified teachers at under-market salaries, there is continual teacher churn. Indeed, charter schools in Michigan lead the nation in teacher turnover. Charter schools have boomed to such an extent in Detroit that they enroll more students than do Detroit Public Schools, despite data that indicates that children in Detroit Public Schools actually perform better academically. When charter schools move into an area, the funds that used to go to public schools shrink. When charter schools become widespread, as they have in Detroit, public schools get shut down, certified teachers leave or get laid off, and neighborhoods deteriorate.<sup>9</sup>

**Charters in Texas** – A charter school in Dallas spent 70% less than the state average on students while it paid its administrators (all related to the owner) hundreds of thousands of dollars. Student achievement at the school was among the lowest 5% in the state. The school also hired a convicted felon and one of its former teachers was sentenced to prison for sexually molesting two fifth graders.<sup>10</sup>

## VOUCHERS

About vouchers, the non-partisan Center for Tax and Budget Accountability came to two major conclusions:

- “None of the independent studies performed of the most lauded and long standing voucher programs in the U.S.—Milwaukee, Wisconsin; Cleveland, Ohio; and Washington, D.C.— found any statistical evidence that children who utilized vouchers performed better than children who did not and remained in public schools.
- “After controlling for school type and student demographics, a study commissioned by President George W. Bush found that students who attend traditional K-12 public schools outperform students who attend either charter schools or private religious schools, irrespective of denomination.”<sup>11</sup>

**Vouchers in Indiana** – Indiana created the largest voucher system in the country in 2011. While vouchers were initially approved to serve low-income families located near failing schools, today less than 1% of vouchers serve low-income families. Most families who receive vouchers are not poor. More than 50% of voucher recipients go to families whose children have never even attended public schools.<sup>12</sup>

## EDUCATION SAVINGS ACCOUNTS & TAX CREDIT SCHOLARSHIPS

ESAs and TCSs are mechanisms that channel tax dollars to private schools. ESAs and TCSs allow parents who want to enroll their children in a religious school—Christian, Muslim, Hindu, Buddhist, or other affiliation—to do so at taxpayer expense. Curriculum and student records at private schools are not open to the public. There is little to no public oversight of privatized schools.<sup>13</sup>

## Privatizing K-12 Public Education

---

### Sources (with clickable links):

- 1 Center for Popular Democracy (2015). Tip of the iceberg: Charter school vulnerabilities to waste, fraud, and abuse. Washington, D.C.: Center for Popular Democracy.
- 2 The Civil Rights Project (2010). Choice without equity: Charter school segregation and the need for civil rights standards. Los Angeles, California: UCLA.
- 3 Molnar, A. (2017, March 1). Dismantling public education: Turning ideology into gold. Institute for New Economic Thinking. Boulder, Colorado: National Education Policy Center.
- 4 Baines, L. (2010). The teachers we need vs. the teachers we have. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield.
- 5 Information on Harlem Children's Zone: Ravitch, D. (2013, May 13). Geoffrey Canada: Just tell the truth. Diane Ravitch's blog. <https://dianeravitch.net/2013/05/13/geoffrey-canada-just-tell-the-truth/>;  
Rubenstein, G. (2013, January 14). Canada's legendary TED Talk lie. Denver, Colorado: National education policy center. <http://nepc.colorado.edu/blog/canada-s-legend-ary-ted-talk-lie>;  
Charity Navigator (2017). Harlem Children's Zone. Compensation of leaders (06/2015). <https://www.charitynavigator.org/index.cfm?bay=search.summary&orgid=4398>;  
Love, D. (2014, February 13). Geoffrey Canada to step down from Harlem Children's Zone. The Grio. <http://thegrio.com/2014/02/13/geoffrey-canada-to-step-down-from-harlem-childrens-zone>;  
Feeney, M. (2014, February 10). Geoffrey Canada resigns as Harlem Children's Zone leader after two decades of service. New York Daily News. <https://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/manhattan/canada-steps-ceo-article-1.1608824>;  
Otterman, S. (2010, October 12). Lauded Harlem schools have their own problems. New York Times. <http://www.nytimes.com/2010/10/13/education/13harlem.html>;  
Harlem Children's Zone (2017). Return of organization exempt from income tax (form 990). Harlem Children's Zone website. [https://hcz.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/02/H CZ\\_2016-Form-990-PD.pdf](https://hcz.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/02/H CZ_2016-Form-990-PD.pdf);  
Grant Thornton (2016, June 30). Consolidated financial statements together with report of independent certified public accountants of Harlem Children's Zone, Inc. and subsidiaries as of June 30, 2016. New York: Grant Thornton LLP. <https://hcz.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/01/Harlem-Children-Zone-Inc.-and-Sub-6-30-16-FINAL.pdf>.
- 6 Information on KIPP: UCLA Civil Rights Project; Horn, J. (2016). *Work hard. Be hard*. Lanham, Maryland: Rowman and Littlefield;  
Wang, M. (2014, October 15). Charter school power broker turns public education into private profits. ProPublica. <https://www.propublica.org/article/charter-school-power-broker-turns-public-education-into-private-profits>;  
KIPP website (2017). KIPP commitment to excellence. [http://www.kipp.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/KIPP\\_Commitment\\_to\\_Excellence\\_Sample.pdf](http://www.kipp.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/KIPP_Commitment_to_Excellence_Sample.pdf);  
Heilig, J., Williams, A., McSpadden McNeil, L., & Lee, C. (2011). Is choice a panacea? An analysis of black secondary student attrition from KIPP, other privately operated charters, and urban districts. Berkeley Review of Education 2(2). <http://escholarship.org/uc/item/0vs9d4fr>;  
Cohen, R. (2017, January 30). Teachers union battle escalates at KIPP charter school. American Prospect. <http://prospect.org/article/teachers-union-battle-escalates-kipp-charter-school>;  
Miron, G., Urschel, J., Saxton, N. (2011, March). What makes KIPP work? Kalamazoo, Michigan: Study Group on Educational Management Organizations. <https://www.edweek.org/media/kippstudy.pdf>;  
Cheng, A., Hitt, C., Kisida, B., & Mills, J. (2017, March 6). Journal of School Choice 11(2). <http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/15582159.2017.1286210?journalCode=wjcs20>;  
Baker, B., & Miron, G. (2015). The Business of Charter Schooling: Understanding the Policies that Charter Operators Use for Financial Benefit. Washington DC: National Education Policy Center;  
Graves, L. (2016, April 28). Exposed by CMD: Kipp's efforts to keep the public in the dark while seeking millions in taxpayer subsidies. PR Watch. <https://www.pwatch.org/news/2016/04/13096/exposed-cmd-kipps-efforts-keep-public-dark-while-seeking-millions-taxpayer>;  
Burris, C. (2016, December 22). Why opening a charter school is like opening your own business. Washington Post. [https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/answer-sheet/wp/2016/12/22/under-trump-will-the-marketplace-be-the-only-regulator-of-school-choice/?utm\\_term=.23037385fea0](https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/answer-sheet/wp/2016/12/22/under-trump-will-the-marketplace-be-the-only-regulator-of-school-choice/?utm_term=.23037385fea0);  
KIPP schools (2017). 990 tax forms. Washington, D.C.: KIPP. <http://www.kipp.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/05/2016-17-KIPP-Fdn-Form-990-PUBLIC-DISCLOSURE.pdf>;  
Barnum, M. (2018, July 24). New documents show what KIPP told Mike Feinberg leading up to his firing. Chalkbeat. <https://www.chalkbeat.org/posts/us/2018/07/24/new-documents-show-what-kipp-told-mike-feinberg-leading-up-to-his-firing/>;  
Hartocollis, A. (2018, February 22). Michael Feinberg, a founder of KIPP Schools, is fired after misconduct claims. New York Times. <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/02/22/us/kipp-sexual-misconduct-michael-feinberg.html>;  
Texas School Venture Fund (2018). TSVF website: About us. <https://txsvf.org/about-tsvf/>.
- 7 Civil Rights Project (2016, March 16). Study finds many charter schools feeding "school-to-prison pipeline." Los Angeles, CA: Civil Rights Project. <https://civilrightsproject.ucla.edu/news/press-releases/featured-research-2016/study-finds-many-charter-schools-feeding-school-to-prison-pipeline>.
- 8 For comparisons, see: National Center for Education Statistics (2018). The condition of education 2018. Washington, D.C.: NCES. <https://nces.ed.gov/programs/coe/ataqlance.asp>;  
Center for Public Education (2015). School choice: What the research says. Washington, DC: National School Boards Association;  
Schneider, J. (2017, August 26). The biggest difference between private, charter and public schools isn't test scores. It's marketing. Salon. <https://www.salon.com/2017/08/26/the-biggest-difference-between-private-charter-and-public-schools-is-not-test-scores-it-is-marketing/>;  
Braun, H., Jenkins, F., Grigg, W. (2006). Comparing private schools and public schools using hierarchical linear modeling. Washington, DC: National Center for Education Statistics. <https://nces.ed.gov/nationsreportcard/pdf/studies/2006461.pdf>;  
Orr, A. (2003, October). Black-white differences in achievement: The importance of wealth. Sociology of Education 76, 281-304;  
Saltman, K. (2012). The failure of corporate school reform. Boulder, Colorado: Paradigm, p. 115;  
The Civil Rights Project (2010). Choice without equity: Charter school segregation and the need for civil rights

## Privatizing K-12 Public Education

---

- standards. Los Angeles, California: UCLA. <https://www.civilrightsproject.ucla.edu/research/k-12-education/integration-and-diversity/choicewithout-equity-2009-report>.
- 9 For information on Michigan and Detroit: Detroit Free Press (2014). Database: Search Michigan Merit Exam, ACT results by district or school. <http://www.freep.com/interactive/article/20130624/NEWS06/306240061/Database-Search-Michigan-Merit-Exam-ACT-results-by-district-school>;
- United States Census Bureau (2014). State and county quick facts: Detroit. <http://quickfacts.census.gov/qfd/states/26/2622000.html>;
- United States Census Bureau (2014); State and county quick facts: Rochester Hills. <http://quickfacts.census.gov/qfd/states/26/2669035.html>;
- Binelli, M. (2017, September 5). Michigan gambled on charter schools. Its children lost. New York Times Magazine. <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/09/05/magazine/michigan-gambled-on-charter-schools-its-children-lost.html>;
- Zernike, K. (2016, June 28). A sea of charter schools in Detroit leaves students adrift. New York Times. <https://www.nytimes.com/2016/06/29/us/for-detroits-children-more-school-choice-but-not-better-schools.html>;
- Robinson, J., & Lloyd, B. (2017, September). Teacher turnover in Michigan. Lansing, MI: Michigan Department of Education. [https://www.michigan.gov/documents/mde/Teacher\\_Mobility\\_Brief\\_Final\\_2017.09.18\\_v2\\_ada\\_601772\\_7.pdf](https://www.michigan.gov/documents/mde/Teacher_Mobility_Brief_Final_2017.09.18_v2_ada_601772_7.pdf);
- Einhorn, E., & Levin, K. (2018, September 18). 'This is horrific': Detroit charter school stuns parents and students with news that it will close next week. Chalkbeat. <https://chalkbeat.org/posts/detroit/2018/09/26/this-is-horrific-detroit-charter-school-stuns-parents-and-students-with-news-that-it-will-close-next-week/>;
- Henderson, S. (2016, December 6). Betsy Devos and the twilight of public education. Detroit Free Press. <https://www.freep.com/story/opinion/columnists/stephen-henderson/2016/12/03/betsy-devos-education-donald-trump/94728574/>.
- 10 Texas Education Agency (2014). School Report Card: Children First of Dallas (057811101). Austin, Texas: TEA; Ramirez, M. (2017, August 4). Former Dallas teacher sentenced to 40 years for sexually assaulting students. Dallas Morning News. <https://www.dallasnews.com/news/crime/2017/08/04/former-dallas-charter-school-teacher-sentenced-sex-assaults-students>;
- Hacker, H. (2013, September 10). Lack of background checks closes charter. Dallas Morning News, pp. 1B & 8B;
- Hacker, H. (2010, December). Funds misuse, nepotism feared at Texas charter schools. Dallas Morning News. <https://www.dallasnews.com/news/education/2010/12/19/funds-misuse-nepotism-feared-at-texas-charter-schools>;
- Hacker, H. (2016, April 1). Texas lets troubled Dallas, Houston schools die slow death. Dallas Morning News. <https://www.dallasnews.com/news/news/2016/04/01/texas-lets-troubled-charter-school-die-a-slow-death>; Texas Education Agency (2014). School Report Card: Children First of Dallas (057811101). Austin, Texas: TEA.
- 11 Center for Tax and Budget Accountability (2017/5). Analysis of Indiana school choice scholarship program. Chicago, IL: CTBA. <https://www.warrick.k12.in.us/docs/SchoolChoice.pdf>.
- 12 Vouchers in Indiana and Wisconsin: Lavertu, S., & Witte, J. (2009, March). The impact of Milwaukee charter schools on student achievement. Brookings Institute. [https://www.brookings.edu/wp-content/uploads/2016/06/03\\_charter\\_lavertu\\_witte.pdf](https://www.brookings.edu/wp-content/uploads/2016/06/03_charter_lavertu_witte.pdf);
- Ross, S., cited in Browne, M. (2013, August 14). Private school voucher scam: 75% of applicants for statewide expansion of taxpayer funded private school vouchers not currently attending public schools. One Wisconsin Now. <http://onewisconsinnow.org/press/private-school-voucher-scam-75-of-applicants-for-statewide-expansion-of-taxpayer-funded-private-school-vouchers-not-currently-attending-public-schools/>;
- Waddington, J., & Berends, M. (2017). Impact of the Indiana Choice Scholarship Program: Achievement effects for students in upper elementary and middle school. [http://creo.nd.edu/images/people/Waddington\\_Berends\\_Indiana\\_Voucher\\_Impacts\\_06.24.17.pdf](http://creo.nd.edu/images/people/Waddington_Berends_Indiana_Voucher_Impacts_06.24.17.pdf);
- Ho, S. (2017, August 11). DeVos says that vouchers could be part of federal tax overhaul discussions. Chicago Tribune. <http://www.chicagotribune.com/news/nationworld/politics/ct-devos-school-vouchers-tax-overhaul-20170811-story.html>;
- Center on Education Policy (2011). Keeping informed about school vouchers: A review of major developments and research. Washington DC: CEP, p. 3. <http://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED522161.pdf>;
- Turner, C., Weddle, E., & Balonon-Rosen, P. (2017, May 12). The promise and peril of school vouchers. National Public Radio. [https://www.npr.org/sections/ed/2017/05/12/520111511/the-promise-and-peril-of-school-vouchers?utm\\_source=twitter.com&utm\\_medium=social&utm\\_campaign=npred&utm\\_term=npnews&utm\\_content=20170512](https://www.npr.org/sections/ed/2017/05/12/520111511/the-promise-and-peril-of-school-vouchers?utm_source=twitter.com&utm_medium=social&utm_campaign=npred&utm_term=npnews&utm_content=20170512).
- 13 Two taxpayer supported private schools in Florida: : American Youth Academy (2017). Website: School of Thought followed by AYA. [http://www.ayatampa.org/about/mission\\_philosophy.cfm](http://www.ayatampa.org/about/mission_philosophy.cfm);
- First Academy website (2017). Philosophy. <https://thefirstacademy.org/about/about/>;
- First Academy website (2017). Doctrinal statement. <https://thefirstacademy.org/about/about/doctrinal-statement/>.